

City of Springfield, Massachusetts
Community Police Hearing Board
Annual Report for 2012 - 2013

CHAIR

Attorney George Bourguignon

MEMBERS

Robert C. Jackson

Albert Trangese

Rev. Gail Hill

Carmen Berry

Salvatore Circosta

Richard Muise

March 20, 2014

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
TABLE A Complaints by Source	6
TABLE B Complaints by Race	7
TABLE C Allegations filed by source	8
TABLE D CPHB Findings by Type	9
Description of Appendices included with this report	10
CBHB OBSERVATIONS	11
CPHB RECOMMENDATIONS	14

Appendix 1 CPHB Data summary spreadsheets (2012 and 2013)

Appendix 2 Lawsuits involving excessive force (10 years)

Appendix 3 Executive Order of Mayor Sarno

**COMMUNITY POLICE HEARING BOARD
ANNUAL REPORT for 2012/2013**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The annual report for the Community Police Hearing Board (CPHB) provides an overview of the history and purpose of the Board, including the relevant aspects of Mayor Sarno's Executive Order which created the Board.

History and Purpose of Board.

The CPHB was created by an Executive Order of Mayor Sarno in February 2010. The CPHB was an evolution from the earlier Citizen Complaint Review Board (CCRB) established by former Mayor Ryan in response to a study conducted by criminal justice experts Professor Jack McDevitt of Northeastern University and his Associate, Dr. Amy Farrell, following the filing of a complaint by the Pastor's Council with the Massachusetts Commission Against Discrimination (MCAD) and a settlement which resulted in the study.

The current chair of the CPHB is Attorney George Bourguignon, who replaced Attorney Cynthia Tucker, who formerly served as MCAD Commissioner, and oversaw the investigation of the original complaint filed by the Pastor's Council. One of the original complainants from the Pastor's Council included former Vice Chair of the CPHB, Reverend Amos Baily; a party to the Pastor's Council settlement at the MCAD. Other current members of the CPHB include: Robert C. Jackson, Albert P. Tranghese, Reverend Gail Hill, Salvatore Circosta, and Richard Muise. Over the past 2 years, Joanne Morales-Harrison, and Terry Aberdale and Ronald Krupke also served as members of the Board, and were replaced by the new members.

The CPHB Process.

Under the Executive Order, the CPHB sits as an independent and non-police mayoral agency providing civilian oversight over the investigation of citizen complaints by the police department, recommendations to the Police Commissioner as to initiating disciplinary charges and hearing decisions for the Police Commissioner's consideration as required. A copy of the Executive Order is included in Appendix 3 to this report. The Board is empowered to receive, hear, make findings and recommend action on complaints against Springfield police officers which allege the use of excessive or unnecessary force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, or the use of offensive language. Investigations of complaints are conducted by the Springfield Police Department Internal Investigation Unit staff (IIU) under the direction of the Police Department Captain of Professional Responsibility.

Complaints may be made by any person whether or not that person is a victim of, or witness to, an incident. In addition, the Captain of Professional Responsibilities reviews all reports of injury to prisoners for the purpose of whether or not the department should initiate an IIU investigation and for consideration of possible disciplinary charges. Dispositions by the board on complaints are forwarded to the police commissioner. As determined by the CPHB, dispositions may be accompanied by recommendations regarding disciplinary measures. The Commissioner then determines whether or not to issue a charge letter, leading to a full hearing in front of the CPHB acting as hearing officer under the civil service law; Chapter 31 of the Massachusetts General Laws.

If a hearing is held on the charges, findings of fact are made and a recommendation for disposition is included with the CPHB hearing results sent to the Police Commissioner.

The findings as to each allegation in the complaint may include:

- (a) "Unfounded," where the investigation determined no facts to support that the incident complained of actually occurred;
- (b) "Sustained," where the complainant's allegation is supported by sufficient evidence to determine that the incident occurred and the actions of the officer were improper;
- (c) "Not sustained," where there are insufficient facts to decide whether the alleged misconduct occurred;
- (d) "Exonerated," where a preponderance of the evidence shows that the alleged conduct did occur but did not violate the policies, procedures, practices, orders or training of the SPD.

Overview of Data Concerning Complaints Reviewed.

This report provides an overview and analysis of Internal Investigation Unit (IIU) data for period covering 2012 and 2013. The data has been arranged in tables which reveal trends in regard to the number, type, and resolution of complaints against Springfield Police Department personnel. The data is also broken down according to whether the complaint was initiated by a citizen or by a member of the Springfield Police Department.

To place the data in perspective, the following Table provides an indication of the level and frequency of involvement that the police officers have with the public in Springfield.

The data covers the total number of calls for service (CFS) and the total number of arrests for the past three years, not including juveniles:

	2011	2012	2013
CFS	183,839	173,463	176,897
Arrests	5,627	4,432	3,952

As noted, the Police Department total calls for service through the "911" emergency system decreased approximately 9% for the 2012 period compared to the 2011 timeframe. While the calls for service rose slightly for the 2013 period compared to 2012, the number for 2013 shows a 8% drop compared to the 2011 period. Similarly, the total number of arrests data shows a significant decline during the 2012/2013 period; a 21% decline from 2011 to 2012 and an additional 9% drop from the 2011 number.

Tables A through D on the following pages in this report break down the number of complaints reviewed by the CPHB, in various categories.

Table A for the 2012 period shows a breakdown of statistics of Complaints by source (Internal SPD administrators or Citizens). It shows there were a total of 86 Complaints reviewed by the CPHB during 2012. This compares to a total of 160 complaints for the 2011 period; representing a 46% decline in the number of complaints from the 2011 period to the 2012 period.

Of these complaints, a total of 71 Citizen's Complaints filed in 2012 and a total of 15 generated internally by the Department itself as administrative action.

TABLE A - 2012	
Complaints by Source	
<i>Internal</i>	15
<i>Citizen</i>	71
TOTAL	86

TABLE A - 2013	
Complaints by Source	
<i>Internal</i>	11
<i>Citizen</i>	81
TOTAL	92

Table A for the 2013 period shows there were a total of 92 Complaints reviewed by the CPHB during 2013. This represents a 7% increase from the period from 2012 compared to the period covering 2013, but still reflects an overall decline from the 2011 period of 42.5%.

The CPHB reviewed a total of 81 Citizen's Complaints in 2013 compared to a total of 11 generated internally by the Department itself.

In comparison, there were a total of 109 Citizen's Complaints filed in 2011 and a total of 51 generated internally by the Department itself.

The number of total complaints reviewed in each of the past two years was significantly down from 160 complaints for 2011 and 136 from the prior year reviewed covering 2010.

Table B breaks down the citizen complaints by the race of the complainant. Of the 71 complaints filed by citizens for the 2012 period, there were 55 where the race of the citizen complainant was provided. Of those, 17 were filed by citizen complainants who identified themselves as Black; 29 citizen complainants who identified themselves as Hispanics and 9 citizen complainants who identified themselves as white.

TABLE B – 2012	
Complaints by Race	Number
<i>Unknown</i>	16
<i>Asian</i>	0
<i>Black</i>	17
<i>Hispanic</i>	29
<i>White</i>	9
TOTAL	71

TABLE B - 2013	
Complaints by Race	Number
<i>Unknown</i>	14
<i>Asian</i>	0
<i>Black</i>	23
<i>Hispanic</i>	17
<i>White</i>	27
TOTAL	81

For the period covering 2013, of the 81 complaints filed by citizens for the 2013 period, there were 70 where the race of the complainant was provided. Of those, 23 were filed by complainants who identified themselves as Black; 17 complainants who identified themselves as Hispanics and 27 complainants who identified themselves as white.

Table C breaks down the total number of Citizen Complaints by type allegations and further breaks down internally generated complaints compared to citizen generated.

As indicated, for the 2012 period of review there were a total of 20 citizen complaints alleging misconduct involving either physical/hands or physical/equipment. There were 28 citizen complaints which alleged "rudeness". There were a total of 6 complaints involving criminal charges, (3 from SPD Administration and 3 from Citizens).

Table C – 2012		
Allegations by Type	SPD Admin	Citizens
<i>Rudeness</i>	0	28
<i>Rules and Regs</i>	7	20
<i>Physical/Hands</i>	3	18
<i>Physical/Equipment</i>	2	2
<i>Criminal</i>	3	3
TOTAL	15	71

TABLE C - 2013		
Allegations by Type	SPD ADMIN	Citizens
<i>Rudeness</i>	0	34
<i>Rules and Regs</i>	3	26
<i>Physical/Hands</i>	3	15
<i>Physical/Equipment</i>	4	5
<i>Criminal</i>	1	1
TOTAL	11	81

As indicated, for the 2013 period of review there were a total of 20 citizen complaints alleging misconduct involving either physical/hands or physical/equipment. There were 34 citizen complaints which alleged "rudeness". There were a total of 2 complaints involving criminal charges, (1 from SPD Administration and 1 from Citizens).

Table D shows the CPHB recommendations, and breaks down the disposition of the different findings made. As to the 86 cases reviewed in 2012, a total of 11 were “sustained” meaning the complainant’s allegations were supported by sufficient evidence to determine that the incident occurred and the actions of the officer were improper.

TABLE D - 2012		
CPHB Findings by Type	Internal	Citizen
<i>Returned</i>	0	0
<i>Not Sustained</i>	9	19
<i>Sustained</i>	4	7
<i>Unfounded</i>	0	7
<i>Exonerated</i>	2	36
<i>Commissioner's Discretion</i>	0	2
TOTAL	15	71

TABLE D - 2013		
CPHB Findings by Type	Internal	Citizen
<i>Returned</i>	0	0
<i>Not Sustained</i>	0	15
<i>Sustained</i>	0	8
<i>Unfounded</i>	0	13
<i>Exonerated</i>	5	51
<i>Commissioner's Discretion</i>	0	0
TOTAL	5	87

As to the 92 cases reviewed in 2013, a total of 8 were “sustained” meaning the complainant’s allegations were supported by sufficient evidence to determine that the incident occurred and the actions of the officer were improper.

Appendix 1 contains all data for all 86 complaints. By reviewing the data, a geographic location for the complaint, as well as a comparison of the recommended discipline by the CPHB can be compared side by side.

The data indicates the Police Commissioner accepted the findings and imposed the recommended disposition or exceeded the disciplinary recommendation by the CPHB in every case disposed of in 2012 and 2013. There are two matters reviewed in the calendar year 2013 that the CPHB has sustained that are pending hearings and have not yet been disposed of by the Police Commissioner.

Appendix 2 provides a summary of all police excessive force litigation over the past ten years. The table indicates that the City has been involved in 33 lawsuits alleging a deprivation of civil rights through excessive force in the past 10 years. As to those lawsuits, 7 have been dismissed by the court. 6 were won at trial and resulted in a verdict in favor of the City or its officers. 7 cases remain open, and 13 cases were settled. As such, there have been no verdicts in favor of a plaintiff against the City or its officers over the past ten years in any lawsuit alleging police misconduct for excessive force.

Appendix 3 provides a copy of the existing Executive Order creating the Community Police Hearing Board established by Mayor Sarno.

CBHB OBSERVATIONS

The following are some of the observations of the Board. These observations (as well as the recommendations that follow) echo earlier observations from earlier reports. However, the 2012/2013 period was one of transition for the CPHB, as former MCAD Commissioner Cynthia Tucker and Rev. Amos Bailey had completed their public service. As such, it is important that the institutional experience of former members of the CPHB be carried through in support of the intent that the Board reflect on the history that preceded it, and evolve as intended:

- Several complaints reviewed by the CPHB in the past involved the issue of videotaping of police officers. Videotaping has been the subject of recent cases providing guidance to Massachusetts Police Officers on this issue and the CPHB wants to make sure that Springfield Police Officers receive training in this area through handout materials at roll call, or through annual in-service training. The proliferation of the technology and the blurring of the line between press and private citizen means that many of our images of current events come from bystanders with a ready cell phone or digital camera rather than a traditional film crew, and news stories are now just as likely to be broken by a blogger at her computer as a reporter at a major newspaper.
- As one case has stated: In our society, police officers are expected to endure significant burdens caused by citizens' exercise of their First Amendment rights. See *City of Houston v. Hill*, 482 U.S. 451, 461 (1987) (“[T]he First Amendment protects a significant amount of verbal criticism and challenge directed at police officers.”). Indeed, “[t]he freedom of individuals verbally to oppose or challenge police action without thereby risking arrest is one of the principal characteristics by which we distinguish a free nation from a police state.” *Id.* at 462-63. The same restraint demanded of law enforcement officers in the face of “provocative and challenging” speech, *id.* at 461 (quoting *Terminiello v. Chicago*, 337 U.S. 1, 4 (1949)), must be expected when they are merely the subject of videotaping that memorializes, without impairing, their work in public spaces.
- There are a large number of complaints which are unfounded or where police officers are exonerated. It has been the CPHB observation that, by and large, the majority

of those cases which are not sustained result from the non-cooperation of witnesses. While the board can only speculate as to the reasons for non-cooperation, there is a general concern by the CPHB that complainants and witnesses may fear retribution or they have a sense that "nothing will be done" as a result of their complaints. The data indicates that, where the CPHB held hearings and did have cooperation of witnesses, findings against officers were sustained and discipline was appropriate, without any retribution against the witnesses.

- In order to provide greater assurances to witnesses as to the integrity of the existing process, while the Police Commissioner has respected the work of the Commission in each case disposed of, The CPHB process would benefit by an increased show of support by other City Officials.
- There is a need for more outreach and public education as to the role and duties of the CPHB to dispel any perceptions about coming forward and voicing complaints and participating in the citizen complaint process. Attendance at public meetings has been sparse and a greater understanding and increased public participation would increase public confidence in the Springfield Police Department.
- Many complaints reviewed involved complaints of "rudeness" by officers. Such incidents have the potential to escalate into a volatile situation. In addition, such complaints tend to discourage participation in the citizen complaint process and erode the community trust of the police department. There were no instances of complaints for rudeness being brought to the CPHB by SPD internal administrators. This is to be expected as it is hoped that supervisors are able to handle such complaints without the need for intervention by the CPHB. However, greater efforts should be made to address rudeness complaints brought by citizens in an alternative dispute resolution setting. The Board would like to develop a voluntary mediation process which emphasizes dialogue between parties and provides a safe environment where parties can air their views about events or issues leading to the dispute. The process would be intended to develop mutual understanding between the parties in the course of resolving the dispute. Mediation could potentially be

resolved by providing both parties with an opportunity to express themselves freely and work toward a mutually agreed-upon resolution of a dispute.

- The Citizen's Police Academy provides a useful bridge to help understand the workings of the police department and has helpful education materials.
- The IIU has been very professional in their dealings with the Board and very accommodating in their schedule to provide information to the Board.

CPHB RECOMMENDATIONS

The following are some of the recommendations of the board in regard to the policies and practices of the IIU as well as police conduct and training, and the structure of the CPHB:

- Board members believe that the City should consider the feasibility of additional training to prevent incidents where there are complaints of "rudeness" from escalating to potentially violent situations or which tend to discourage participation in the citizen complaint process and erode the community trust of the police department. Not every push or shove, even if it may later seem unnecessary in the peace of a judge's chambers, violates the Fourth Amendment. The calculus of reasonableness must embody allowance for the fact that police officers are often forced to make split-second judgments -- in circumstances that are tense, uncertain, and rapidly evolving -- about the amount of force that is necessary in a particular situation. This issue is clearly a "two way street," and the City should consider the availability or avenues to provide its police officers with additional tools to deal with its interactions with persons in crisis. It is hard to imagine any violent incident (other than a random act of violence) that did not begin with some form of harsh words either immediately before or sometime in the past. As such, the CPHB recommends that the Springfield Police Department consider the feasibility of additional training in this area.
- Topics of study could include: recognition of persons in crisis and crisis de-escalation skills. The Houston Police Department has instituted such a Crisis Intervention Team (CIT) program. Officers receive training as outlined, then return to patrol. When a call is coded as a CIT call, it is dispatched to a CIT officer. CIT officers respond to routine calls when not responding to CIT calls. An important aspect of the training is the involvement of community partner agencies. These agencies include mental health professionals from area mental health facilities who are involved in the training. The training in Houston includes aspects of the inclusion of role-plays whereby officers put the theory of the classroom into practice. The CPHB acknowledges the financial limits and time constraints placed on training programs, and also recommends that the Springfield Police Department investigate the potential for grant funding from the U.S. Department of Justice, as well as the co-operation of state criminal justice training authorities for this type of program.

- The Springfield Police Department and CPHB should schedule more public meetings in each area of the City, coupled with increased circulation to inform the general public of the time and place of the meetings. In addition to posting of meetings pursuant to the Open Meeting Law, the meetings should be publicized through dissemination to local media outlets.
- Meetings of the CPHB should be held in conjunction with neighborhood and community groups to work together in increased outreach and education activities. Social media such as "facebook" may be useful in education and outreach activities. Another suggestion is to assign members of the CPHB to be responsible for contacting various community groups. For example, the Sheriff's Department has regular contact with a wide cross section of Springfield Community Organizations, the Pastor's Council has regular meetings, and each Pastor could be asked to notify his or her members.
- The Citizen's Police Academy should be more widely publicized and its materials more widely distributed. While the ten week commitment to complete the program can be daunting, the Citizen Police Academy should consider the presentation of some shorter programs to be held in conjunction with CPHB outreach efforts.
- The CPHB Board members should all attend one of the Police Academy classes to be introduced to new recruits and explain their role.
- Once again the CPHB recommends that the Police Department expand the use of video cameras in cruisers.

The CPHB contends the cameras would assist the City in protecting the patrol officers from assaults and unfounded allegations of police misconduct. The video cameras may also provide protection to civilians from police misconduct.

According to a report of The International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) studying the use of in-car cameras, 97 percent of the citizens polled across the U.S. support the use of in-car cameras for law enforcement. While law enforcement views the acquisition of camera technology as a means to demonstrate their professionalism and increase officer safety, the public views cameras as a means to guard against abuse. Despite the difference in opinions, both the public and the police have shown support to use the technology, making the acquisition and

implementation of an in-car camera program a win/win proposition for all.

According to the IACP report, in 93% of the time a complaint is filed regarding police conduct and there is video evidence available, the officer is exonerated. See IACP's *Report on In-Car Cameras*, 2004.

- The above observations and recommendations will be shared with the Lieutenant of the IIU as well as the Police Commissioner for discussion, potential revision and feasibility of implementation. In addition, the Board is planning a public hearing to review the data and observations and seek public input.

APPENDIX 1

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2012

Date Review	Review By	Incident Date	AO #	CC #	Race	MF	Location of Incident	Nature of Complaint	Summary	Board Recomm.	Final Disposition
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	8/19/2012	PIE#12-62	45	Black	Female	52 Rodney Smith Circle	Rudeness	Officer was rude, yelled at her, her mother and children. Investigate shooting death of Officer Kevin Ambrose.	Commissioner's discretion	Exonerated
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	6/5/2012	12-075	ADMIN			90 Lawton St.	Criminal A	Deputy Dudley will convene a critical incident review board on this matter. It will consist of himself, Deputy McFarlin, Deputy Barberi, Lt. Kasirnakis and one CPHB member. They shall call witnesses.	Dispose of at Commissioner's discretion	
10/25/12	A. Tranghese	8/12/2012	12-100	ADMIN			29 Cameron St.	Physical/Equip A	Invst. injuries to prisoner Omar Rivera.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/23/12	A. Tranghese	4/27/2012	12-053	ADMIN			260 Plumtree Rd.	Physical/Equip A	911 call from citizen who stated that an officer driving in his personal vehicle pulled him over and threatened with his gun	exonerated	Not Sustained
7/31/12	C. Jackson	5/15/2012	12-065	12-13		Male	Worthington St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer punched him in the nose and made the cuffs too tight.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/4/12	C. Jackson	7/24/2012	PIE#12-65	48		Female	15 Girard Ave.	Rudeness	Police told her she was interfering in a police investigation.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
8/23/12	C. Jackson	5/17/2012	PIE#12-56	39		Male	Alden St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officer arrested complainant for no reason.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
12/13/12	C. Jackson	10/1/2012	12-120	12-31		Female		Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states an officer stopped her daughter as she was walking home from school and searched her, looking for a gun.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/2/12	C. Jackson	2/28/2012	12-051	12-10	Black	Male	38 High St.	Criminal C	Complainant states officer took his "POD" without notifying him.	Exonerated	Exonerated
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	6/15/2012	12-065	12-16	Black	Female		Physical/Hands C	Complainant states officers used physical force with her even though she told them she was pregnant.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/4/12	C. Jackson	6/22/2012	12-092	12-22	Black	Male	Sams Sports Bar	Physical/Hands C	Officers used physical force on complainant during a fight.	Exonerated	Exonerated
7/31/12	C. Jackson	6/30/2012	PIE#12-51	35	Black	Female	19 Lamont St.	Rudeness	Complainant states that police, P/TA, mail trucks, school buses, etc. follow her whenever she drives and police watch her home from a parking lot across the street. This has been going on since Summer 2011.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/31/12	C. Jackson	5/3/2012	PIE#12-46	31	Black	Female	Page Blvd.	Rudeness	Complainant states she was having car trouble and states she could not control the speed of her car.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
2/3/12	A. Tranghese	1/11/2012	PIE#12-05	06	Black	Male	Island Pond Rd.	Rudeness	Officer was rude when he pulled her over and laughed at her.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/24/12	A. Tranghese	4/9/2012	PIE#12-38	12-27	Black	Female	743 Beacon Cir.	Rudeness	Officer spoke to him rudely when he pulled him over for speeding.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	6/18/2012	PIE#12-57	40	Black	Female	Stafford St.	Rudeness	Citizen claims officer's report is inaccurate and that he didn't listen to her but yelled at her.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
2/6/13	A. Tranghese	8/12/2011	PIE#13-02	2	Black	Male	Cabaret Bar	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant did not like the way officer handled her traffic accident incident.	Exonerated	Exonerated
7/11/13	C. Jackson	12/9/2011	13-050	13-26	Black	Male	671 State St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers did not take assault report.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/2/12	C. Jackson	5/27/2012	PIE#12-55	38	Black	Female	182 Tyler St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant reports religious discrimination, sexual assault, A&B, invasion of privacy, falsification of evidence, perjury and dereliction of duty by officers who arrested him in 2011.	Exonerated	Exonerated
10/4/12	C. Jackson	6/30/2012	12-093	12-23	Hispanic	Male		Physical/Hands C	Complainant feels officers did not arrive in a timely manner in response to her house alarm and didn't search the perimeter of her property after she found nothing wrong inside the house.	Exonerated	Exonerated
11/30/12	A. Tranghese	9/26/2012	12-113	12-28	Hispanic	Male	School St.	Physical/Hands C	Officers put a hand over his mouth and tried to choke him.	Exonerated	Exonerated
									Complainant states THAT BACK IN 2002 HE WAS BEATEN BY OFFICERS	Exonerated	Exonerated

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2012

5/3/12	C. Jackson	2/13/2012	12-027	12-03	Hispanic	Female	14 Mill St.	Physical/Hands C	Complainant states officers hit her son in the head with a flashlight.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
8/29/12	A. Tranghese	6/9/2012	12-083	12-15	Hispanic	Male	246 Walnut St.	Physical/Hands C	Several officers hit and kicked him.	Exonerated	Exonerated
8/29/12	A. Tranghese	6/11/2012	12-096	12-24	Hispanic	Male	Oakland St.	Physical/Hands C		Exonerated	Exonerated
1/11/13	C. Jackson	10/9/2012	12-131	12-35	Hispanic	Female	Carew St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer pushed her against her vehicle and touched her "in the wrong way."	Exonerated	Not Sustained
9/21/12	Rev. Bailey	8/12/2012	PIE#12-71	54	Hispanic	Female	55 Leitch St.	Rudeness	Complainant states officer was very rude and disrespectful.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
9/21/2012	Rev. Bailey	9/10/2012	PIE#12-74	57	Hispanic	Female	Main St.	Rudeness	Complainant states she was arrested for nothing she wants respect.	Exonerated	Exonerated
7/21/12	C. Jackson	1/15/2012	PIE#12-54	37	Hispanic	Male	233 Centre St. I.O.	Rudeness	Officer served complainant three noise violations on one night.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/10/12	A. Tranghese	2/25/2012	PIE#12-24	18	Hispanic	Female	Roosevelt Ave.	Rudeness	Officers yelled at her and her daughter to shut up. Officers refused to give their names and badge numbers.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/24/12	A. Tranghese	4/12/2012	PIE#12-44	29	Hispanic	Female	Blessed Sacrament Church	Rudeness	Off duty officer pulled them over for driving around in her Atwater Park neighborhood.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/3/12	C. Jackson	4/2/2012	PIE#12-37	12-25	Hispanic	Female	Wilbraham Rd.	Rudeness	Complainants feels officers were rude to them at traffic stop.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
9/7/12	C. Jackson	7/14/2012	PIE#12-63	46	Hispanic	Female	65 Newland St.	Rudeness	Officer didn't respond to information given to him by complainant that a 7 year old was hit by a drunk on a dirt bike.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/3/12	C. Jackson	2/20/2012	12-029	ADMIN	Hispanic	Male	130 Peart St.	Rules & Regulations A	Invest. Death of prisoner. Deputy McFarlin met with Capt. Clapprood regarding best practices and procedures to be followed during the operation of her shift. Dep McFarlin has confidence in her ability to properly run the squad and recommended that the mat complainant states officer accompanied DSS worker and searched his apartment for children without a search order.	Exonerated	Exonerated
9/7/12	C. Jackson	6/11/2012	12-090	12-20	Hispanic	Male	1708 Dwight St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states officers repeatedly stop him and check his private parts for drugs.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/24/12	A. Tranghese	3/28/2012	12-040	12-09	Hispanic	Male	12 Quebec St	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states officers entered her house when no one was home.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/31/12	C. Jackson	4/12/2012	PIE#12-48	33	Hispanic	Female	132 Plainfield St.	Rules & Regulations C		Exonerated	Not Sustained
11/26/13	G. Hill	9/14/2013	PIE#13-34	28	Unknown	Female	40 Bristol St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers did not take proper procedures after being sent to her home. They let a man go home who had threatened her daughters with a firearm.	Exonerated	Verbal Reprimand
9/7/12	C. Jackson	7/29/2012	PIE#12-66	49	White	Male	16 Boston Rd.	Rudeness	Complainant stated officer was dictorial.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/2/12	C. Jackson	4/28/2012	PIE#12-43	28	White	Female	18 Sullivan St.	Rudeness	Officer #1 was rude and condescending and Officer #2 was polite, considerate and helpful in response to a complaint about her tenant.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/31/12	C. Jackson	7/6/2012	PIE#12-59	42	White	Female	1715 Carew St.	Rudeness	Complainant states the officer called her crazy and did not write a report about an alleged assault on the complainant.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/2/12	C. Jackson	5/19/2012	PIE#12-50	34	White	Male	1702 Boston Rd	Rules & Regulations C	Officers never took down his name or filed a report of an incident in which complainant states he was being stalked by two individuals.	Exonerated/ No hearing needed	Not Sustained
12/21/12	A. Tranghese	10/5/2012	12-125	12-32	Hispanic	Female	JFK Jr. High	Physical/Hands C	Complainant states officer left bruise marks on her son's arms.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/18/12	A. Bailey	8/13/2012	12-101	ADMIN	Hispanic	Female	Bay St.	Physical/Hands A	Invest. Injuries to prisoner Eddie Alvarez. Invest. Arrest of Mr. Rodriguez per Capt.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/15/12	A. Bailey	3/13/2012	12-039	ADMIN	Male	Male	500 Hancock St.	Physical/Hands A	Cheeham. Injury to head.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
2/21/13	A. Bailey	8/22/2012	12-147	12-39	Male	Male	Worcester St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer choked him.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
10/18/12	A. Bailey	8/6/2012	PIE#12-70	53	Male	Male	769 Worthington St.	Rudeness	Officer was rude to him.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2012

5/31/12	C. Jackson	4/7/2012	PIE#12-45	30	Male	St. James Ave.	Rudeness	Complainant states "officer is retarded." Officer was rude and gave complainant a ticket she doesn't feel she deserved.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
8/23/12	C. Jackson	7/20/2012	PIE#12-64	47	Female	Main and State Street	Rudeness	Order from Commissioner to investigate any police interaction at this construction job site.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/10/12	A. Tringhese	3/29/2012	12-041	ADMIN		Bay & Roosevelt	Rules & Regulations A		Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/21/12	Rev. Bailey	1/31/2012	12-091	12-21			Rules & Regulations C	Complaint received on behalf of Officer harasses complainant by complainant's attorney Saia.	Not Sustained	Retraining
4/18/12	C. Jackson	10/24/2011	12-032	12-05	Male	White St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officer retrained by Deputy Dudley 10/31/12.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
1/18/12	C. Jackson	8/24/2012	12-103	12-26	Female	84 Bowles St.	Physical/Equip C	Officers did not offer medical assistance to an accident victim.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
11/21/12	Rev. Bailey	9/28/2012	12-126	12-33	Female	Mill & Main	Physical/Hands C	Officers maced her and were very "ruff."	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
6/14/12	Rev. Bailey	4/8/2012	12-052	12-11	Female	Alumni Nightclub	Physical/Equip C	Officer twisted her arm up behind her back and bent and twisted her left thumb.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
8/23/12	C. Jackson	6/13/2012	12-086	12-17	Female	174 Locust St.	Physical/Hands C	Complainant states officer pushed her during a disturbance at a nightclub.	Not Sustained	Exonerated
3/2/12	C. Jackson	12/1/2011	12-022	12-02	Female	36 Cumberland St	Physical/Hands C	Officer "mashed" her in the face and she was scratched.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
7/2/12	C. Jackson	5/22/2012	PIE#12-52	36	Male	Main St.	Rudeness	Complainant reports being knocked to the floor and beaten by officers	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/7/12	C. Jackson	8/5/2012	PIE#12-68	51	Male		Rudeness	Complainant is afraid officer might threaten him because is now seeing Mr. Gutierrez old girlfriend.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
12/21/12	A. Bailey	10/11/2012	PIE#12-77	59	Male	Summer Ave.	Rudeness	Complainant states that Officer pulled out his gun at traffic stop.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/21/12	A. Bailey	11/24/2011	PIE#12-72	55	Male	25 Pequot St. IO	Rules & Regulations C	Officer is rude to him and threatens to take away complainant's taxi license.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/26/12	A. Tringhese	9/30/2012	PIE#12-58	41	Male	Chestnut St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers did not assist him in getting his court ordered visitation with his child.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/10/12	A. Tringhese	3/17/2012	PIE#12-36	14	White		Rudeness	Complainant states he was stopped and searched by two Hispanic officer who called him a druggie. He states after they searched him twice and drove him around in an unmarked police care they realized they had the wrong person and let him go.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
10/18/12	A. Bailey	5/9/2012	PIE#12-73	56	Male		Rudeness	Complainant states officer was rude at the scene of a multi car accident and didn't take time to listen to her side of the story.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/21/12	Rev. Bailey	8/20/2012	PIE#12-69	52	Female		Rules & Regulations C	Officer came to complainants house and complainant told officer he wanted to make a complaint but says officer did not follow through.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
7/31/12	C. Jackson	9/10/2011	12-064	12-12	Female	130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states she cooperated with narcotics officers providing her info remained confidential. She was informed by the defendant that the police her info was listed in the police report and she is being threatened.	Request more investigation	Not Sustained
1/18/12	C. Jackson	9/6/2012	12-108	ADMIN		130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations A	Complainant believes Mis Vargas breaches confidentiality. C. Jackson requested the case be forwarded to the next step. Hopefully a hearing could bring out more clear "answers."	Retraining	Retraining
								Prisoner snuck heroin into her cell and was found by Matron to be nearly incoherent. Transported to BMC. Matron received a written reprimand and retraining for two half day sessions on Jan. 17 and Jan. 30th 2013. LL Kastirakis		

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2012

9/7/12	C. Jackson	6/26/2012	12-087	ADMIN			281 State St.	Physical/Hands A	Invest. Physical injuries to prisoner. Case sent to C. Chelli 9/14/12 for 90 day letter. Commissioner ordered retraining to be done by Deputy McFarlin. Capt. Cheetham sent letter to complainant on 5/5/13	Sustained	Not Sustained
5/15/12	A. Bailey	5/10/2012	PIE#12-48	ADMIN			130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations A	Officer was re-assigned from a Q5 Watch to front window. Off. arrived but said he didn't have his gun so he went home to get it. Capt. States off. did not forget his gun, but left it home because of his assignment. Written Reprimand delivered 5/9/12	Sustained	Written Reprimand
12/21/12	A. Tranghese	11/10/2012	12-140	ADMIN			130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations A	Abuse of sick time. 90 DAY TO BE SERVED BY 2/8/13. Hearing held 3/27/13. Two day suspension to be served 4/9 and 4/16/13. suspension letter served 4/4/13 by Sgt. Manley.	Sustained	Suspended
11/30/12	A. Tranghese	10/9/2012	12-124	ADMIN				Rules & Regulations A	Invest. Officer's non-compliance with SO#12-117. Investigation emailed to C. Chelli re: 90 day letter due by 12/27/12. Hearing set for 1/23/13 agreed to letter of reprimand served 1/24/13.	Sustained	Written Reprimand
6/21/12	C. Jackson	3/20/2012	12-033	12-06	Female	Black	Wilbraham	Rules & Regulations C	Officer Lee's ex-wife filed a complaint of harassment by Officer Lee. 6/27/12 PER Capt. Cheetham: Officer is to submit monthly reports for 90 days to Commissioner's Office indicating that he is attending counseling sessions. He will consult with his C.O.	Sustained	Sustained/Counseling
	C. Jackson	1/11/2012	12-038	12-07	Male	Black		Physical/Hands C	Complainant states he was racially profiled and physically abused during his arrest. 90 day letter served 4/6/12.	Sustained	Exonerated
11/21/12	Rev. Bailey	9/17/2012	12-115	12-29	Male	Hispanic	Main & Carew St.	Criminal C	Complainant states officers stole money from him. 90 Day letter by 12/19/12 HEARING BY: 2/9/13. Hearing held 1/30/13	Sustained	Exonerated
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	7/6/2012	PIE#12-80	43	Female	Hispanic	2566 Main St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states officers did not make a report about her stolen keys. Capt. W. Collins retained Officers Robles and Leon Resto on 8/25/12.	Sustained	Retraining
9/21/12	Rev. Bailey	6/26/2012	12-102	ADMIN	Female	White	15 Coffax St.	Criminal A	Complainant reports officer gave her alcohol to drink and then raped her as she was posing for pictures at his photography studio. Officer was physically abusive and arrested him for no reason. Originally PIE#12-78	Sustained	Other
1/8/12	C. Jackson	9/18/2012	12-116	12-30	Male	Black		Physical/Hands C	CHANGED TO SO#12-116 ON 9/26/12 PER COMMISSIONER	Sustained/Hearing	Not Sustained
	Tranghese	8/27/2011	11-135	I	Female		35 Prentice St.	Criminal	Complainant filed a Criminal Complaint with SVU alleging officer bought her drinks and she was later raped by officer during a photo shoot for modeling pictures. 90 Day letter served 12/17/11. Hearing Notice served 1/27/12.	Sustained/Pending Hearing	Sustained
7/31/12	C. Jackson	5/22/2012	12-072	ADMIN				Rules & Regulations A	Comm. Ordered an investigation into the dispatch call re: Incident Report 12-7072-OF. 90 day letter. Hearing WAIVED. Retrained by Lt. Kasimakis on 3/29/13.	Sustained/retraining	Retraining
11/8/12	C. Jackson	9/27/2012	12-119	ADMIN			130 Pearl St.	Criminal A	Officer R. Miller reports items stolen from the trunk of his department issued cruiser. Deputy Chief spoke with Officer Miller about the handling and tracking of dept. issued equipment on 11/28/12..	Unfounded	Dismissed

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2012

10/25/12	A. Tranghese	6/20/2012	PIE#12-67	50		Female	E. Columbus Ave.	Rudeness	Officer was rude and did not make out an accident report even after complainant told him the other driver admitted the vehicle was not registered or insured.	Unfounded	Retraining
9/27/12	A. Tranghese	7/25/2012	12-087	12-25		Male	5 Abbe Ave.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant filed a complaint with MCAD Officer was rude to her when he issued her a traffic citation.	Unfounded	Unfounded
5/24/12	A. tranghese	4/24/2012	PIE#12-47	32	Black	Female	Page Blvd.	Rudeness	Complaint received in Spanish.	Unfounded	Not Sustained
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	6/10/2012	12-079	12-14	Hispanic	Male	State St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer was rude and swore at her when he gave her a ticket.	Unfounded	Not Sustained
8/16/12	A. Tranghese	7/19/2012	PIE#12-61	44	Hispanic	Female	Dwight St.	Rudeness	Complainant states an officer slapped him across the face twice as other officer watched and laughed and he states 23 pills of Backofen medication were missing from his RX bottle that had been at the police station.	Unfounded	Unfounded
8/29/12	A. Tranghese	5/19/2012	12-089	12-19	White	Male	130 Pearl St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer was rude when he responded to her noise complaint.	Unfounded	Not Sustained
10/25/12	A. Tranghese	8/18/2012	12-107	12-27	White	Female	67 Vincent St.	Rules & Regulations C		Unfounded	Not Sustained

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2013

Date	Review By	Incident Date	AO #	CC #	Race	M/F	Location of Incident	Nature of Complainant	Summary	Board Recomb	Final Disposition
11/11/13	C. Jackson	10/21/2012	12-127	ADMIN	White	Male	267 Chestnut St.	Physical/Hands A	Investigate injury to prisoner that occurred with officer while officer was off duty. Officer threw her daughter down to the ground after complainant called to have daughter removed from her home.	Exonerated	Written Reprimand
11/11/13	C. Jackson	10/17/2012	12-129	12-34	Female	Female	77 Belle St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer pushed her against her vehicle and touched her "in the wrong way."	Exonerated	Not Sustained
11/11/13	C. Jackson	10/9/2012	12-131	12-35	Hispanic	Female	Carew St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer was rude.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
11/11/13	C. Jackson	10/22/2012	PIE#12-78	60	Other	Male	Sol-Tech	Rudeness	Anonymous complaint accusing Off. R. Vega of elderly abuse.	Exonerated	Exonerated
11/17/13	A. Tranghese	11/2/2012	12-138	12-36			65 Pine St.	Regulations C		Unfounded	Unfounded
10/17/13	C. Jackson	7/29/2013	13-077	ADMIN			74 Irvington St.	Firearms/Shooting A	Invest. Officer Involved Shooting	Exonerated	Exonerated
10/17/13	C. Jackson	9/5/2013	PIE#13-33	26	Hispanic	Female	Main & Bancroft	Rudeness	Officer was rude to her at a construction site. He let one co-worker of hers through the barricade but not the others.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/17/13	C. Jackson	9/6/2013	PIE#13-35	29	Hispanic	Female		Rudeness	Officers stopped her and her half brother because her brother fit the description of someone who had been reported by Walgreens.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/17/13	C. Jackson	9/15/2013	PIE#13-38	32	Hispanic	Male		Rudeness	Officers had "attitudes" when they pulled him over.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/17/13	C. Jackson	9/15/2013	PIE#13-40	34	White	Female	Main & Liberty	Rudeness	Officer was rude and called her white trash and arrested her.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/17/13	C. Jackson	7/30/2013	13-081	13-35	Black	Female	65 Knox St.	Regulations C		Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/17/13	C. Jackson	8/6/2013	13-086	13-39	White	Female	Summer Ave.	Regulations C	Officer issue the complainant a traffic warning she doesn't like.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/31/13	G. Hill	8/28/2013	13-091	ADMIN	Hispanic	Male	Kenefick Park	Firearms/Shooting A	Investigate Officer Involved Shooting.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/31/13	G. Hill	8/12/2013	13-084	13-36	Black	Male	King St.	Physical/Hands C	Complainants state they were just walking down the street and the police "roughed them up."	Exonerated	Exonerated
10/31/13	G. Hill	8/20/2013	PIE#13-39	33	Black	Male	282 Walnut St.	Rudeness	Police responding to a domestic, did not listen to him and he was arrested.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/31/13	G. Hill	9/26/2013	PIE#13-45	39	Black	Female	Breckwood Blvd	Rudeness	Officer cursed and yelled at her at traffic stop.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
10/31/13	G. Hill	8/24/2013	PIE#13-41	35	White	Female	17 Arthur St.	Rudeness	Officer did not listen to her when she tried to explain an on-going problem with her neighbor.	Exonerated	Unfounded
10/31/13	G. Hill	8/19/2013	13-087	13-40	White	Female	BMC	Rules & Regulations C	Nurse at BMC sent an email to Kathleen Brown reporting lack of professionalism and compassion shown by officers while at BMC with parent of deceased infant.	Exonerated	Exonerated
11/18/13	A. Tranghese	6/6/2013	13-092	13-41	Other	Female	Salvation Army	Physical/Equip C	Officer injured her sons and used mace on one of them.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
11/26/13	G. Hill	9/5/2013	PIE#13-36	30		Male	111 Belmont Ave.	Rudeness	Officers asked him for ID and were rude and offered no apology.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
11/26/13	A. Tranghese	9/24/2013	PIE#13-44	38	White	Female	Main St.	Rudeness	Officer was rude when he pulled her over for traffic violation.	Exonerated	Exonerated
11/26/13	G. Hill	9/14/2013	PIE#13-34	28	Unknown	Female	40 Bristol St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers did not take proper procedures after being sent to her home. They let a man go home who had threatened her daughters with a firearm.	Exonerated	Verbal Reprimand

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2013

11/28/13	C. Berry	9/22/2013	PIE#13-43	37	Black	Male	417 Liberty St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant feels officers report was incorrect.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
11/28/13	C. Jackson	4/18/2013	13-099	13-44	Female	Female	67 Sanderson St.	Rules & Regulations C	Harassment and favoritism Needs a hearing 90 day letter served 12/9/13.	Not Sustained Sustained/Hearing	Not Sustained
11/28/13	G. Bourignon	9/13/2013	13-106	13-46	White	Male	District Court	Rules & Regulations C	Officer burst into a closed session involving the complainant and a clerk magistrate, was rude and intimidating.	Unfounded	Unfounded
12/13/13	A. Tranghese	10/7/2013	13-109	13-48	Hispanic	Female	401 Bay St.	Physical/Hands C	Officers pushed complainant and her family members.	Exonerated	Exonerated
12/13/13	A. Tranghese	10/8/2013	PIE#13-46	40	White	Female	15 Avon Place	Rudeness	Complainant states officers were rude and wouldn't answer her questions.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
12/13/13	A. Tranghese	10/22/2013	PIE#13-49	43	White	Female	Chestnut St.	Rudeness	Officer was rude at a detour and sent her a ticket in the mail.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
12/13/13	A. Tranghese	10/3/2013	PIE#13-42	36	Hispanic	Male		Rudeness	Officers pulled him over and called him names. Complainant also feels officers lied about him.	Unfounded	Not Sustained
2/13/13	A. Tranghese	1/16/2013	13-003	ADMIN	White	Female	130 Pearl St.	Firearms/Acc. Discharge	Invst. Rpt. From Lt. Moynihan about accidental discharge of duty weapon. Of. O'Halloran received firearms retrainin on @25 and 2/26/13 by Ofcs. M. Dumas & G. McCain, state certified firearm instructors. One day suspension 3/5/13.	Sustained	Suspended
2/13/13	A. Tranghese	9/19/2013	13-103	13-45	White	Female	37 Narragansett St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers would not arrest her son's drunk girlfriend. Officers told son to drive her Home. Complainant told police her son was also drunk but they let him drive. He drove and when he got out of vehicle the girlfriend took over the vehicle and ran compl	Unfounded	Not Sustained
2/21/13	A. Bailey	8/22/2012	12-147	12-39	White	Male	Worcester St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer choked him.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
2/27/13	A. Tranghese	12/22/2012	PIE#13-01	1	White	Male	Summer Ave.	Rudeness	Officer was rude to them as they driving to see Bright Nights. Letter sent to complainant on 2/28/13. Officer retrained at the Academy on 3/4/13 as ordered.	Not Sustained	Retraining
2/8/13	A. Tranghese	12/6/2012	12-146	12-38	Black	Male	Duggan School	Physical/Hands C	Complainant states officer physically abused him	Exonerated	Exonerated
2/8/13	A. Tranghese	1/6/2013	PIE#13-03	3	Hispanic	Male	Summer Ave.	Rudeness	Officer issued him two bogus traffic citations. Officer at the front window yelled at him and told him he couldn't pick up his stolen property report until the next day.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
2/8/13	A. Tranghese	12/17/2012	PIE#12-81	62	White	Male	130 Pearl St.	Rudeness	Complainant feels she was denied her right to formal documentation of a traffic accident she was involved in because the officer did not write a police report or cite the other driver. She also wants an investigation into any pre-existing relationship the	Exonerated	
2/8/13	A. Tranghese	11/16/2012	PIE#12-79	61	Black	Female	1350 Main St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers did not take assault report.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
2/8/13	A. Tranghese	8/12/2011	PIE#13-02	2	Black	Male	Cabaret Bar	Rules & Regulations C	Officer lost his department issued radio. 5/20/13 Ofc. completed payment for a total of \$526.80 for lost radio.	Exonerated	Sustained
2/8/13	A. Tranghese	1/5/2013	PIE#13-04	ADMIN	White	Male	130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations A		Sustained	Sustained

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2013

3/28/13	A. Bailey	1/30/2013	13-010	13-06	White	Male	Wendover Rd.	Physical/Hands C	Complainant Sgt. punched him in the face after finding marijuana and paraphernalia in complainants vehicle.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
3/28/13	A. Bailey	2/13/2013	PIE#13-10 8		Black	Male	36 Taber St.	Rudeness	Complainant reported to Attorney General's Office that officer was rude to him.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
3/7/13	C. Jackson	1/16/2013	13-005	01	Black	Male	1492 Allen St.	Physical/Equip C	Officer responded to a disturbance at the complainant's daughter's dance school and was asked to leave. Complainant states officer walked him outside and slammed him onto his automobile. Complainant states he sustained injury to his right side of face, bl	Exonerated	Not Sustained
3/7/13	C Jackson	2/16/2013	PIE#13-08 7		Black	Male	1647 Main St.	Rudeness	Officer opened complainants beer at the package store and told him to leave premises.	Exonerated	Exonerated
3/7/13	C Jackson	1/12/2013	13-006	13-02	Black	Male	130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states upon release his cell phone was not returned to him along with his other property. Cee Jackson recommends that officers take more time to review prisoners property when prisoner is discharged.	Exonerated	Exonerated
3/7/13	C Jackson	1/18/2013	13-002	ADMIN/ CC#13-10	Hispanic	Female	42 Ridge Dr. Somers, CT	Criminal A	Officer arrested at her home in CT during a domestic incident while out IOD. Originally ordered as an Administrative Investigation then later a Citizen's Complaint was filed. So per Capt. Cheatham, it was issued a CC#. 90 day letter served 4/5/13. WAV	Hearing	
4/12/13	A. Tranghese	1/19/2013	13-009	03	Black	Male	53 Daytona St.	Physical/Equip C	Officers punched him and maced him.	Exonerated	Exonerated
4/17/13	C Jackson	3/9/2013	13-025	ADMIN	Hispanic	Male	494 Central St	Physical/Hands A	Invst. Rpt. By Capt. Cheatham regarding injuries to prisoner.	Exonerated	Exonerated
4/17/13	C Jackson	2/8/2013	13-012	ADMIN	White	Male	130 Pearl St.	Rules & Regulations A	Invst. Rpt. By Sgt. Tardiff reporting his radio that was lost while pushing stranded mv's during snow storm. Radio was recovered when snow melted.	Exonerated	Exonerated
4/17/13	C Jackson	1/29/2013	13-007	ADMIN			27 Mallard Cir. Agawam	Firearms/Shooting A	Invst. Incident involving the Department issued firearm of Officer Carla Daniele.	Sustained	Suspended
4/5/13	A. Tranghese	1/11/2013	13-011	13-07	Hispanic	Female	86 Keith St.	Criminal C	Complaint originally designated a PIE investigation. On 2/13/13 it was rescinded and re-issued as an SO. MIS-USE OF CJIS INFORMATION Complainant reports her plate was run several times. Retraining re: policies & procedures re: RMV information and Exo	Exonerated	Retraining
4/5/13	A. Tranghese	2/17/2013	PIE#13-11 9		Black	Male	Coconuts Bar	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant feels report of A&B by bar bouncers was not investigated in a timely manner. Complainants girlfriend Samaria Morrison also submitted a duplicate complaint	Exonerated	Unfounded

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2013

4/5/13	A. Tranghese	2/15/2013	13-014	13-09	Hispanic	Female	Worthington St.	Physical/Hands C	Physical/Hands C	Officer reports officer pushed her 15 year old son against a window and searched him. Complainant does not know why he was arrested and states officers refused his repeated requests for medical attention.	Unfounded	Exonerated
4/5/13	A. Tranghese	1/16/2013	13-019	13-11	White	Male	Walmart	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Mother reports that police injured her son at the time of his arrest.	Unfounded	Not Sustained
5/10/13	C. Jackson	2/18/2013	13-013	13-08	Hispanic	Female	Forest Park	Physical/Hands C	Physical/Hands C	DYS reported injuries to child after arrest.	Exonerated	Exonerated
5/10/13	C. Jackson	1/21/2013	13-023	ADMIN	White	Male	1655 Boston Rd	Physical/Hands A	Physical/Hands A	Officers only served one of two restraining orders but told complainant that that both had been served. Officers were retrained.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/10/13	C. Jackson	1/30/2013	PIE#13-07	6	Black	Female	47 Bloomfield St.	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Officer was rude, threatening and gave him a ticket.	Retraining	Retraining
5/2/13	Rev. Bailey	3/27/2013	PIE#13-14	12	Black	Male	Central St.	Rudeness	Rudeness	Officer issued a ticket to complainants grandson and then complainants grandson got his license taken away and the SPD does not know where that property is.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/2/13	Rev. Bailey	2/7/2013	PIE#13-12	10	Hispanic	Female	Boston Road	Rudeness	Rudeness	Officer was rude to complainant when complainant did not use the detour and went through a construction site.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/2/13	Rev. Bailey	3/22/2013	PIE#13-13	11	Hispanic	Male	Plainfield St.	Rudeness	Rudeness	Invst. Rpt. submitted by Capt. Cheetham re: injuries to prisoner Kevin McDonald.	Exonerated	Exonerated
5/23/13	A. Tranghese	3/4/2013	13-018	ADMIN	White	Male	1171 Main St.	Physical/Hands A	Physical/Hands A	Mother complains that officers physically abused her blind son after responding to a house alarm call.	Exonerated	Exonerated
5/23/13	A. Tranghese	3/9/2013	13-026	13-16	White	Female	17 Thorndike St.	Physical/Hands C	Physical/Hands C	Officer harasses her and her family. Officer followed complainant around the store questioning him and held him for a weapons check in the parking lot.	Exonerated	Exonerated
5/23/13	A. Tranghese	12/1/2012	PIE#13-15	13	White	Female	Chicopee, MA	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant feels his weapon and LTC were confiscated for no reason.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
5/23/13	A. Tranghese	3/25/2013	13-029	13-18	Black	Male	Price Rite Boston Rd.	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Officer came to her home on behalf of his parents to collect rent and was rude.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/23/13	A. Tranghese	3/26/2013	13-020	13-12	White	Female	33 Margaret St.	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Officer was rude to her.	Unfounded	Unfounded
5/23/13	A. Tranghese	5/5/2013	PIE#13-19	14	White	Female		Rudeness	Rudeness	Officer mishandled situation, and made unnecessary arrests.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
5/31/13	C. Jackson	3/10/2013	13-024	13-13	Hispanic	Female	40 Lexington St.	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states he was punched by several officers at the time of his arrest. 90 Day letter by 6/20/13. Hearing notice served 8/12/13.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
6/13/13	C. Jackson	3/22/2013	13-031	13-19	White	Male	Summer Ave.	Physical/Hands C	Physical/Hands C	Complainant questions the safety of the gun officer used during a training demonstration.	Retraining	Retraining
6/13/13	C. Jackson	4/3/2013	13-038	13-21	White	Male	261 High St Holyoke	Rules & Regulations C	Rules & Regulations C	Retraining confirmed by Capt. Cheetham 9/30/13.	Retraining	Retraining
6/7/13	G. Hill, A. Tranghese	3/23/2013	13-027	13-17	Hispanic	Female	167 Leyfred Ter.	Physical/Equip C	Physical/Equip C	Officers maced and arrested her husband.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/1/13	A. Tranghese, C. Berry	5/16/2013	PIE#13-21	16	Hispanic	Male	1373 Plumtree Rd	Rudeness	Rudeness	Officers were rude and disrespectful when called to a family dispute.	Exonerated	Retraining

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2013

7/1/13	A. Tranhese, C. Berry	5/7/2013	PIE#13-20	17	Black	Female	51 Amore Rd.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states he was refused a police report by Off. Wadajula regarding a domestic incident	Exonerated	Retraining
7/1/13	A. Tranhese, C. Berry	3/27/2013	13-036	13-20	Black	Female	1365 Berkshire Ave.	Rudeness C	Officer arrested her son at Kennedy Middle School for punching a teacher. Complainant stated that Sgt. reported taking \$10.00 worth of cocaine from complainants mouth and three \$100.00 bills from his pocket	Unfounded	Exonerated
7/1/13	A. Tranhese, C. Berry	4/8/2013	13-039	13-22	White	Male	48 Draper St.	Rules & Regulations C	Complainant states an officer yelled at him to "get the fuck out of here."	Unfounded	Unfounded
7/1/13	C. Jackson	6/12/2013	PIE#13-23	15		Male	Worthington St.	Rudeness	Officer was rude and indifferent toward complainant at a domestic.	Exonerated	Exonerated
7/1/13	C. Jackson	6/14/2013	PIE#13-24	18	White	Female		Rudeness	Complainant reports officer beat him while he was in his cell.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
7/19/13	G. Hill	5/3/2013	13-049	13-25	Black	Male	130 Pearl St.	Physical/Hands C	Officer didn't respond to his complaint and told complainant he shouldn't be doing business around here.	Unfounded	Exonerated
7/20/13	A. Tranhese	6/16/2013	PIE#13-25	19		Male	764 Main St.	Rudeness	Officers refused to stop a repo company from taking a client's vehicle.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/20/13	A. Tranhese	6/16/2013	PIE#13-27	20	White	Male	155 Maple St.	Rudeness	Complainant submitted a letter to the Commissioner describing what she believed an officer spoke inappropriately to a young man not following the officer's order to pick up his trash. Complainant Walker submitted a Citizen's Complaint also regarding same.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
7/26/13	A. Tranhese	5/1/2013	13-046	13-24	Black	Male	Mill St.	Rules & Regulations C	Sgt. was rude to Atty. when Atty went to records to request info for his client.	Exonerated	Retraining
8/13/13	C. Jackson	5/21/2013	13-055	13-27	White	Male	130 Pearl St.	Rudeness	Officer threatened Mr. Keefe's secretary re: personal delivery to Officers home. One day suspension issued 8/19/13. Appeal Hearing held 9/4/13. Disposition "Exonerated."	Exonerated	Exonerated
8/13/13	C. Jackson	6/26/2013	13-066	13-30	White	Male	West Springfield	Rudeness	Commissioner ordered retraining. Retraining completed 11/6/13 Sgt. R. Rodriguez	Sustained	Retraining
8/23/13	A. Tranhese	5/29/2013	13-061	13-28	White	Male	State & Berlin	Rules & Regulations C	Officer approached teenagers skipping school, questioned them, was aggressive, and threw complainants ipod on the ground, breaking it. 90 Day letter served 8/29/13	Exonerated	Exonerated
9/12/13	G. Hill	6/26/2013	13-068	13-31	White	Female	10 Falmouth St.	Physical/Hands C	HEARING BY: 10/25/13 Hearing scheduled for 10/23/13 Officer used excessive force while arresting complainant.	Exonerated	Exonerated
9/12/13	G. Hill	6/22/2013	13-069	13-32	Black	Male	Berkshire Ave.	Physical/Hands C	Complainant states he was wrongfully arrested and struck by an officer. CPHB member G. Hill recommended that officers be retrained in regard to the process of handling children during an arrest.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/27/13	C. Berry	7/20/2013	PIE#13-32	25	Black	Female	Main & Court St.	Rudeness	Mother of hit & run accident victim complains officers were not attentive to her daughter and were rude to her.	Exonerated	Not Sustained

Appendix 1 - CPHB Data 2013

9/27/13	C. Berry	8/15/2013	13-085	13-38	White	Male	Liberty St.	Rules & Regulations C	Officers asked to see complainant's paper's pertaining to his Federal Service Dog. Officer choked him which caused him to receive treatment at BMC three times and then finally surgery at Umass Worcester. No dates given. No officer identified.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
9/27/13	C. Berry	7/11/2013	13-073	13-33	Hispanic	Male		Physical/Hands C	Complainant states she got a citation for not responding to an emergency vehicle in Springfield. She states her vehicle was in Tynesboro, MA and the vehicle has never been in Springfield.	Not Sustained	Not Sustained
9/27/13	C. Berry	6/2/2013	PIE#13-30	23	White	Female	State St.		Officer interferes with complainants family matters.	Unfounded	Unfounded
9/27/13	C. Berry	8/9/2013	PIE#13-31	24		Male	103 College St	Rudeness	Officers asked him for ID then they were laughing at him and he thought they were going to hurt him.	Unfounded	Exonerated
9/27/13	C. Berry	3/7/2012	PIE#13-29	22	Hispanic	Male	40 Landon St.	Rudeness	Officer beat him and sprayed him with mace on 3/18/13 and continues to harass him and arrest him.	Unfounded	Not Sustained
9/5/13	C. Jackson	3/16/2013	13-064	13-29		Male	McCaffreys Pub Main St.	Physical/Equip C	Officers were rude to him when he claimed to receive a "fake" \$10.00 bill from the clerk at the Pride Station.	Exonerated	Not Sustained
9/5/13	C. Jackson	7/29/2013	PIE#13-28	21	Black	Male	Pride/W. Columbus Ave.	Rudeness		Exonerated	Exonerated

APPENDIX 2

Appendix 2
Police Excessive Force Lawsuits - (10 years)

#	NAME	MATTER #	COURT	CASE #	Disposal of case	Paid
1	Palacio	13-05573	Federal	3:13-cv-30149	pending	
2	Charlemagne	13-05468	Federal	3:12-cv-30090	pending	
3	Hall	13-05169	Federal	3:13-cv-30002	pending	
4	Ververis	12-04334	Federal	3:13-cv-30175	pending	
5	Cayo	12-04216	Federal	3:13-cv-30113	pending	
6	Blakeslee	12-05216	Federal	3:12-cv-30001	settled	\$28,000
7	Bari	12-04215	Federal	3:11-cv-30157	dismissed on City Motion	0
8	Sein	12-03581	Federal	3:12-cv-30015	settled	\$27,500
9	Larkins	11-02828	Federal	3:11-cv-30001	won at trial	0
10	Besette	11-02541	Federal	3:10-cv-30190	settled	\$7,500
11	Thomas	10-01965	Federal	3:10-cv-30090	won at trial	0
12	Henriquez	10-01654	Federal	3:09-cv-30232	settled	\$13,900
13	James, Donald	07-00273	Federal	3:07-cv-40169	dismissed on City Motion	\$0
14	Jones, Melvin	10-01340	Federal	3:10-cv-30244	settled	\$575,000
15	Vasquez	10-01311	Federal App	12-1665	won at trial now on appeal	0
16	Holmes	10-01310	Federal	3:09-cv-11219	dismissed on City Motion	0
17	Caraballo	10-00909	Federal	3:09-cv-30155	won at trial	0
18	Self	10-00109	Superior	HDCV 2009-00280	dismissed on City Motion	0
19	Walker	10-00062	Federal	3:12-cv-30119	pending	
20	Hill	09-30042	Federal	3:08-cv-30175	settled	\$1,000
21	Jiles	09-00038	Federal	3:09-v-30064	settled	\$38,000
22	Skroback	08-00190	Federal	3:09-cv-30063	settled	\$40,000
23	Bakath	08-00156	Federal	3:09-cv-30229	settled	\$23,000
24	Jones, Lucy	07-00127	Federal	3:09-cv-30003	dismissed on City Motion	0
25	Sheppard, Sheila	06-00856	Federal	3:07-cv-30166	dismissed on City Motion	0
26	Alexander	07-00177	Federal	3:07-cv-30085	dismissed on City Motion	0
27	Williams	07-00128	Federal	3:07-cv-30087	won at trial	0
28	Pinkney	07-00231	Federal	3:07-cv-30165	settled	\$13,000
29	Schubert	06-00933	Federal	3:06-cv-30033	won at trial	0
30	Greer	04-00311	Federal	3:05-cv-30001	settled	\$180,000
31	Charvis	03-00011	Superior	3:03-cv-30204	settled	\$32,500
32	Jones, Lucy	03-00008	Superior	HDCV 2003-00604	still open	
33	Mc Creary	98-00003	Superior	3:98-cv-30101	settled	\$38,000

APPENDIX 3

RECEIVED

2010 FEB -3 P 4 06

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE
SPRINGFIELD, MA

**THE CITY OF SPRINGFIELD, MASSACHUSETTS
MAYOR DOMENIC J. SARNO
EXECUTIVE ORDER**

**Community Police Hearing Board
For Springfield Police Department**

I, Domenic J. Sarno, by authority vested in me as Mayor of the City of Springfield, Massachusetts, do hereby order that the Community Police Discipline Board (CPDB or "Board"), is created by Executive Order, and shall operate as follows:

1. Selection of Board Members

The Mayor shall appoint the members of the Board. In doing so he may give consideration to recommendations made from a broad array of groups across the City.

The Board shall consist of 7 members who are residents of the City. Members shall participate in all training and preparatory meetings and act without conflict of interest on the part of any member thereof.

The Board will be chaired by an Attorney with experience in administrative procedures. The chairperson will lead quarterly full Board meetings and work with the Board to determine the full Board meeting schedules and agendas and administration of the Board.

The term of appointment of members shall be three years, however, the initial appointments shall include 1 member who shall serve an initial one year appointment, and two members who shall serve two years in order to stagger the terms for future appointments.

2. Qualifications for Board

The members of the CCRB do not need to have had investigatory experience; however, they must be persons of integrity with diverse backgrounds. Potential Board members should recognize the significant commitment of time that Board membership requires and be willing to commit sufficient time to the effort. In addition to bi-weekly Board meetings, Board members will be occasionally asked to participate in community outreach and education activities.

The members of the Board must agree to keep information on specific complaints or investigations confidential as is the present practice within the IIU. This is a fundamental responsibility and failure to keep private information confidential will be grounds for removal from the Board.

3. Training for Board Members

The Personnel Department and the Law Department shall develop a training program for all new Board members. This training shall include:

- The current procedures for filing and investigating a complaint.
- The elements of a thorough investigation including a review of a number of actual case files from closed investigations.
- The Policies of the SPD regarding respectful treatment of civilians.
- The Policies of the SPD regarding appropriate use of force.
- The Role of Civilian Oversight Boards in other jurisdictions.
- Legal Requirements for protection and confidentiality of private governmental documents.
- Hearing procedures and requirements under the provisions of Civil Service Laws and collective bargaining agreements for the conduct of administrative disciplinary hearings.

As part of this training a set of reference materials should be provided to each Board member. These materials should include copies of all relevant Massachusetts statutes, all SPD policies and procedures regarding officer misconduct and use of force, and a copy of this Executive Order. This training should be repeated annually or when new members are appointed to the Board

4. Responsibility of Board Members

It shall be the responsibility of the Board to:

A. Accept civilian complaints otherwise filed with the Springfield police department (SPD) or any other city or state agency regarding the activities of the SPD (The police commissioner may take appropriate actions to maintain the security of police documents, reports or files examined by the Board).

B. Review the sufficiency of internal investigations completed by the Springfield Police Department, and to make recommendations to the police commissioner for further investigation or action.

C. To act individually or as a group as hearing officers, designated by the Police Commissioner as the appointing authority pursuant to Chapter 31 of the General Laws, in complaints under jurisdiction of the Board pursuant to this Order, taking into account the need for the training and qualifications required for a hearing officer and that a hearing officer who cannot consider a case in a fair and impartial manner because of personal prejudice or bias, shall not consider a particular case and shall so inform the Board.

D. Examples of personal bias include, but are not limited to:

- (a) Familial relationship or friendship with parties to the complaint;
- (b) Being a party to the complaint;
- (c) Witnessing material events relevant to the complaint;
- (d) Having a financial interest in the outcome of the case;
- (e) Holding a bias for or against a party that is sufficient to impair the examiner's impartiality.

E. A Hearing Officer shall avoid making public comment on all pending complaints, investigations and matters, whether or not they are serving on particular cases.

E. A Hearing Officer shall consider the complaint in a fair and impartial manner, ensure that facts are fully elicited, adjudicate all issues and avoid undue delay and shall be conducted in accordance with the applicable provisions of state and federal law, including but not limited to M.G.L. c. 31, pertaining to Civil Service, or the Open Meeting Law, and any applicable provisions of a collective bargaining agreement.

F. The Hearing Officer is also authorized pursuant to Chapter 31 of the General Laws in the case of any unresolved complaint where a hearing is held, to subpoena witnesses, compel their attendance, administer oaths, take the testimony of any person under oath and in connection therewith to require the production of any evidence relating to any matter in question before the Board.

G. A Hearing Officer shall make written findings of fact and a determination of the merits of the complaint and, if the Hearing Officer determines that one or more allegations in the complaint are sustained, a recommendation for any discipline warranted, after providing the employee with an opportunity to speak personally or through a representative and after consideration of the employees work history, including but not limited to any . In the merits determination, the Hearing Officer shall make one of the following decisions about each allegation in the complaint:

- (a) "Unfounded," where the investigation determined no facts to support that the incident complained of actually occurred;
- (b) "Sustained," where the complainant's allegation is supported by sufficient evidence to determine that the incident occurred and the actions of the officer were improper;
- (c) "Insufficient facts," where there are insufficient facts to decide whether the alleged misconduct occurred;
- (d) "Exonerated," where a preponderance of the evidence shows that the alleged conduct did occur but did not violate the policies, procedures, practices, orders or training of the SPD.

H. The Hearing Officer's findings and recommendation for discipline, if any, shall be filed with to the Board and the Police Commissioner. Within seven days after the filing of the report of the Board with the Police Commissioner, the Commissioner shall give to such

employee a written notice of the Police Commissioner's decision, which shall state fully and specifically the reasons therefore, and which shall be subject to the present means of review by civil service appeal or arbitration as provided by the applicable collective bargaining agreement.

I. The Board shall be authorized to attempt by voluntary non-binding mediation to resolve any complaint within its jurisdiction if it deems appropriate and the complainant and the subject officer agree to participate in such mediation

J. The Board shall utilize staff of the personnel, labor relations, citistat and law department of the City subject to appropriation, and such other staff, as are necessary to carry out its duties pursuant to this ordinance. The Personnel Director shall be responsible for the administrative operation of the commission and shall perform such other tasks as the Mayor may determine upon recommendation of the Board. The Director of Labor Relations shall arrange for presentation of cases at hearing. The Law Department shall provide legal advice to the Board.

5. Removal from Board

The Mayor may remove a member from the Board, before their term expires.

6. Public Outreach and Communication

A. To help increase the open access to the complaint process the department will need to educate the public about the complaint reporting process, including information about when and how to file a complaint. Presentations to community groups, schools, community organizations and religious groups about the complaint reporting process may be necessary as part of a broader effort to help people increase trust and confidence in the complaint investigation process.


This communication process should involve both members of the IIU and members of the Board. Joint presentations will help reflect the openness of the department. Such presentations should be made in the neighborhoods of Springfield and should be done in conjunction with existing community organizations whenever possible.

B. In addition, to general education and outreach, the Board shall communicate with complainants about the status of investigations, and (where appropriate) the public. With the assistance of Citistat, the Board shall keep track of all Citizen Complaints, hearings, and findings, and identify each with an incident number, date of incident, location of incident, the nature of the misconduct, the name of the complainant and name of officer or officers alleged to have committed the misconduct and publicly disseminate notice of the review of any such incidents on a quarterly basis, but shall not disseminate the names of any participants or disciplinary action imposed in any incident without the consent of such party.

C. The data gathered by the Board as well as any reports or recommendations voted by the Board with regard to the interaction of police officers and members of the community shall be reviewed by the Police Commissioner for when considering disciplinary actions, promotions, assignments, training or adoption or amendments of the policies and procedures of the Springfield Police Department.

D. After a complaint is closed the Board shall promptly notify the complainant of the findings and may provide copies of any portions of the internal affairs file which are a public record. Any actual order of disciplinary action addressed to an officer is not a public record, and shall not be disclosed by the Board. For the complainant, correspondence shall be sent by certified mail to help ensure they receive notice of the outcome. The Board may send satisfaction surveys, similar to those used by the Cambridge Police Department, to both complainant and officers when each complaint is closed.

This Executive order, as amended, shall take effect on 23rd of FEB., 2010.


Domenic J. Sarno, Mayor
City of Springfield